The Echo of the Alexandrian Scholarship in Provincial Egypt

By
A.H. EL.MOSALLAMY

1-People whom the Mousaeion addressed:

Egypt became part of the Greek world since 332 B.C. and Alexandria, being a very important centre, gave its name to the period followed its foundation. Masses of Greeks came to serve in various branches. Greek language prevailed even in the Roman period. Neither the edict of Caracalla nor Diocletian's reform helped the Latin language to submerge the Greek language, which maintained its existence till a century after the Arab Conquest. (1)

This situation instigated individuals to have private collections or libraries. (2) One of those persons may be Dioscorus of Aphrodito who wrapped up his papers in the leaves of a codex of Menander. The same could be said about the young lady under her head the Haward Homer was found and her features seem to be Greek. These literary papyri could

be the possession of such persons who could be able to read. We can not help saying that the literary papyri found in the tombs and the ruins in the various regions were possessed by persons who were interested in literature.

It is suggested that rolls of literary papyri found with dead people played to the Greeks the same role played by the Book of the Dead for the Egyptians, since a copy of Isocrates' speech "Against Nicocrates" was found lying between a mummy's legs. But the situation is clearly different; the Book of the Dead was generally used by the Egyptians, while it was a matter of selection in regard of the Greeks. So we may think that the text selected by a Greek to accompany him in his tomb as one of the most precious possession of himself. Moreover, the example of the Manchester papyrus of Deuteronomy, which was found wrapped in same pieces of the first book of the Iliad, is considered a kind of cultural fusion in the second century B.C.

One may remember here the general trend which prevailed in the Hellenistic, and perhaps continued in the Roman, period, that is what may be called "The religion of culture". People asked friends and relatives to inscribe on their tombs that they are men of the Muses, believing that such saying may

(3) W.M.F. Petrie, Hawara, Biahmu; and Arsinoe, P. 24; The Legacy of Egypt, P. 252 f.
(4) Legacy of Egypt, P. 253.
relieve them in the other world. In these cases people must be of those who are interested in literature and may be able to read. So, between a group of portraits affixed to the coffin from Hawara, Rubyat and Antinoe and carry the name, few of them mention what may be a profession, e.g. Hermione grammatic, i.e. "Literary lady" or "teacher of letters". It is natural to find literary texts in the private collections of these people as we find with the doctor of army in Karanis. Collections of business men included also, though very few, literary texts, such as the papers of Zenon, which included about ten, and the archive of Aurelius Isidorus, but the archive of Abinnaeus contains nothing of these literary texts.

People interested in literature are expected to be met with in every corner. So, it is not astonishing to find the Apology of Plato and Hector of Astydamas in Socnopaei

(7) P. Ross, Geogr. iii.i.8; J. Rea, list of cornic poets and their plays, Atti dell xlcongr. Intern. di Pap., Milano 1966, P. 217.
(8) C. Preaux, Les Grecs en Egypte, p. 11f.
(9) A. R. Boak, P. Cair; Isidorus.
(10) D. V. Berchem, E. G. Turner etc., The Archive of Abinnaeus.
Nesos on the edge of the desert. The manuscript of Inachus of Sophocles by Dictys the Cretan and the diegesis to Callimachus were found in the village of Tebrynias. Wherever persons who may be considered as elite lived, like the prominent citizen of Oxyrhynshus, Sarapion alias Apollennius, and his family, they are expected to be owners of literary rolls; (11) so also was the victor in competition for poets (12)

There is a class of people who clearly represent the connexion between the Mouseion of Alexandria and the chora. Aurelius Plution, member of the senate of Hermopolis Magna, (13) is described as a member of the Mousein, i.e. scholar. If even, his title was honorary, the relation with the Mouseion (14) still clear. This status reminds us of other members of the Mouseion, i.e. scholars, who have estates in the country, like Julius Asclepiades, philosopher a title which means that he is of the philosophy section of the Mouseion and (15) possesses a property in the Fayoum. From Philadelphia is

(11) P S I. 1248.

(12) P. Oxy. 2838; A. Calderini, stud. Ital. di fil. class. n.s. 27-8, 1956, P. 59 ff.

(13) C.P. Herm. 125 ii= W. Chrest. 40 and C.P. Herm. 124; G.M. Mautis Hermopolis - al - Grande, P; 175 f.


(15) P. Pa. 87. A.D. 155; CF.P. Ryl. 82. 18; Dio Cassius 77. 7.3; O.G.I. 714. 4n.; P. Ryl. 143.2.
Valerius Titianus, who has a property there and described (16) as Member of the Mouseion. The city council of Antinoe honoured Flavius Marcius Seurianus Dionysius, who is described to be "of the company of those maintained tax-free in the Mouseion, Platonic Philosopher and councilor of Antinoe"(17). Valerius Diodorus, owner of a boat and perhaps of a property at Oxyrhynchus is "farmer hypomnemato- graphus and member of the Mouseion"(18).

The aforementioned Valerius Diodorus is met with in company with other two Alexandrian scholars exchanging opinion about methods of procuring books. Diodorus and his two fellows, polion and Harpocration, had special interest in Attic orators. Moreover, Harpocration is the author of a lexicon to orators which is still surviving(19).

To the Members of the Mouseion who have properties in the metropoleis, Tiberius Claudius Demetrius is added(20).

The letter which includes the names of the Alexandrian scholars, Diodorus, Polion and Harpocration, has a special

(16) CF. J.F. Gilliam, Mnemosyne 17, 1964, P. 293 ff.
(17) P. Oxy. 2400.
(18) P. Mert. i. 19. 3; P. Oxy. 2192; JEA. 38, 1952, P. 91ff.
(19) E.G. Turner, Greek Papyri, p. 87.
(20) P. Oxy. 2471. Circ. A.D. 50.
interest. We can see that these scholars are as modern as our scholars of today. They read and investigate books, formulate opinion about the editions and context. They always try to acquire standard books for scholarly purpose. The writer of the letter asks for copies of books six and seven of Komodoumenoi "men made fun of comedy, or topics in comedy" by Hypsocrates. He adds that Harpocrates says that they are among Polion's books, and that he also has his epitomes of Tharsagoras' work named "on the Myths of Tragedy". He also adds: "according to Harpocrates, Demetrius the bookseller has got them. I introduced Apollonius to send me certain of my own books which you will hear of in good time from Seleucus himself. Could you find any, apart from these which I possess, make copies and send them to me. Diodorus and his friends also have some which I have not got".

It seems that we are well informed about the various ways of the movement of books and their context between the Mouseion of Alexandria and the various regions of Egypt. We see also that these regions were not isolated from the products of the Mouseion. This may interpret why the writer of the official letter, sent from the council or Hermopolis Magna to congratulate Aurelius Plution, member of the Mouseion, when quoted a line from Euripides, wrought:

"it is pleasure to look a friend in the eyes" (21)

(21) C.P.Herm. 1251 ii = W. Chrest. 40 and C.P.Herm. 124.
When the writer substituted ἀνδρός for φωτός he caused hiatus, a matter hated by the classical Athenian. This was not completely an error, since it might have come from an anthology, as we shall see later. In the matter of anthologies we perceive the effect of the Mouseion.

The efforts of the Mouseion surely reached the learned people in the chora. We have seen before that the owners of the private collections exchanged copies of books and produced others to keep themselves up-to-date. Booksellers were always there, side by side with local scribes who produced books. From Oxyrhynchus we read on the back of a papyrus carrying a prose:

(22) ἐκ βιβλιοθήκης πραξίου Ἡράκλειος ἀπέγραψεν
These professional scribes played a good role in spreading the work of the scholars of the Mouseion in the various nomes of Egypt, and we are informed about their fees.

(23) Scholars, who may be members of the Mouseion and authors and compilers of literary works, are not infrequently met with either permanently living, or at least being born, and attached to their birthplaces in the chora. Satyrus and his epitomiser Heraclides were natives of Oxyrhynchus. Andriscus and Hermesius are poets of Hermopolis. Athenaeus is a native.

(22) Milne, P. Lond. Lit. 97.
of Naucratis and Nonnus of Panopolis, and Plotinus of Lycopolis. This may interpret the existence of their papers in the various regions of Egypt; and so we hear their literary discussions in places other than Alexandria.

The possessors of literary papyri in the chora, e.g. P. Oxy. 3214 may show that practicing Greek literature was a necessity for success in world affairs in Egypt under the rule of both the Ptolemies and the Romans, and poetry in particular. This attitude seems to be clear in the courses of education (e.g. P. Oxy. 3235). But still we see the Alexandrian scholarship influence apparent in the chora as in the alphabetic glossary (P. Oxy. 3235).

2- Diffusion of the Mouseion's impact in provincial Egypt:

The work of the Alexandrian Mouseion was highly important due to the dramatic end of the creative classical period. It was difficult, without such an effort, to be clear with many themes, their arrangement and their chronological order, especially in regard of manuscripts and editiones principes. Among the benefits of the scholarship of the Mouseion is the distinction between authentic and non-authentic works. The work of the mouseion could be considered as a solid


(25) A. Camero, the wandering poets, Historid 14, 1965, p. 470 ff.
base of our information about Greek Scholary in both literature and science. The papyri inform us that the fruits of the Mouseion spread all over the various parts of Egypt. A roll from Oxyrhynchus, containing hypotheses or synopses of the Euripides arranged in alphabetic order and tell their story, shows the same method used by Callimachus in his Pinakes.

The variant reading in the papyri of the Paeans, along with similar abbreviations for unknown editors, suggests that there was an edition before the writers of these papyri which come from Oxyrhynchus. The papyrus which contains parts of a commentary on Bacchylides' Dithyrambs and repeats a criticism of Callimachus by Aristarchus because he classified the dithyramb in question as a paean, is of a great interest to our subject. It shows that serious literary problems that engaged the Alexandrian scholars were under the sight of the learned men in Oxyrhynchus. It goes without saying that Naucratis was a place where the discussions of the works of the Alexandrian scholarship may occur, since we know that Athenaeus, the native of Naucratis, as well as others, quoted the pinacogtaphical works of Callimachus.

(26) M. Paphathomopoulou, Recherches de Pap., iii, p. 38.
(27) E.G. Turner, Greek papyri, P. 101 f.
(28) P. Oxy. 841 and 2442; see Fraser, Ptol. Alexandria 11 p. 653, n. 34.
(29) P. Oxy. 2368.
(30) Fraser, Ptolem. Alex. 1, p. 452 f., 11, p. 655, n. 46.
(31) Fraser, id., 1, p. 453; 11, p. 656, n. 52. cf. P. Oxy. 1367.
The same could be said about the works of Satyrus about Euripides, which were found in Oxyrhynchus and other places. It is well known that Satyrus was indebted too much to Callimachus; and so the influence of Callimachus ought to be found wherever the works of Satyrus were found.

The influence of the Alexandrian scholarship in the chora is quite clear in the papyri which contain fragments of lists and catalogues belonging to the tradition of Callimachus and his followers. These may be taken as at least indirect products of the early work of cataloguing and listing done in the library. One of these papyri, of late third century B.C., is a fragment of an Index of tragic writers in which the names of three otherwise unknown tragedians occur, together with their ethnics and the number of tragedies which they wrote: Another fragment called by the editor "The Alexandrian lists" The discussion of the "Ode to Pallas", which may be a quotation from Eratosthenes is echoed in Oxyrhynchus.

In fact, the examples of the diffusion of the effect of the Alexandrian scholarship are so frequent that it will appear more than necessary to count here. Moreover, the

(32) P.Oxy. 1176; Fraser, 1, p. 453 F.; 11, P. 656 f., n.57.
(35) P. Oxy. 1611. 158 ff.
(36) see e.g. P. Oxy. 1241; P. Amh. 12; E.G. turner, Chron. d'Egypte 37, 1962, P.150 f.; Id., Greek Papyri, P.116 f.; Fraser, Ptol.Alexandria, chapt.8.
art of librarianship was achieved when Zenodotus, Alexander
the Aetolian and Lycophron undertook to put more than one
and third million books in order in the library of Alexan-
dria. This achievement was illustrated in the Pinakes
of Callimachus, which are considered as registers containing
name of the author, his birthplace, father's name, his tea-
cher, the genre of his work, the titles of his works in al-
phabetic order, citation of opening words, the length of the
work and a note about the authenticity of the work. Calli-
machus huge work on the Pinakes was standing after his unusual
words and phrases which he used and interpreted as both scien-
tist and as a lexicon. This work was also a psychological
factor in his choice of exactness of detail and rejection of
large scale composition, as illustrated in his quarrel with
Apollonius Rhodius. The impact of the work of Callimachus is
seen clearly in the papyri. We can see that the method of
Callimachus is well illustrated even in didactic papyri.

In the field of textual criticism, Plato's view against
use of books. Such view attests the inclination of the classi-
cal Greeks to carelessness of exactness in quotation and

(37) F. Schmidt, Die Pinakes des Kallimachos, Kiel, 1924.
(38) Studia Papytologica XVIII, 1979, P. 135; P. Oxy. 3239.
(39) e.g. P. Achmim, no. 2 ed. P. Collart in BIFAO, XXXI,
P. 43; O.Guerand et P. Jouguet, un livre d'Ecolier, Le
Caire 1938, P. XXII f.
precise chronology. Aristotle believes that science and historical scholarship are not possible on the basis of Plato's view. In the papyri of the first half of the third century B.C., texts on papyri sometimes add lines, sometimes leave lines, in comparison with medieval manuscripts. There are also variants of phrases. Such variants, which sometimes reach twenty one lines, cannot be mere carelessness of the scribe. Studies show that variants in the fragments of both Plato's Phaedo and Laches, on papyri recovered from mummy cartonage at Gurob, are wild, while a part of the sophist on papyrus from el-Hibeh is to better.

It is not always wise to dismiss erratic papyri by considering them merely the property of uneducated people, but more important is to compare them with the literary papyri from the Roman period. A striking phenomenon could be noticed. Errors and divergences in the literary papyri of the Roman period are not as high as in those of the Ptolemaic period. This may be explained that the writers of the early Ptolemaic period felt no compulsion to copy accurately because they did not consider the exact expression of the author as a sacred one. But in the Roman period there was a great respect for the authority of the text. This latter tendency may be ascribed to the Alexandrian scholarship; which follow the

(40) Plato, Phaedrus 274 E.
(41) P.Hibeh, Electa (Pach, 1569); P. Sorbonne Hippolytus (Pack, 393); Pack, 819; 894; 875; 397; 392; 400; S.West, The Ptolemaic papyri of Homer, cologne 1967; E.G.Turner, op.cit., p. 107 f.
Aristotelian tradition. It is noticed that since the middle of the second century B.C., Homeric papyri conform more closely than those of the third century B.C. to the standard text, e.g. no whole series of additional lines, or great variants. They rather contain few emendations and readings of the great Homeric scholars, as almost preserved in the scholia. Galen is good authority about this change, when he tells us that Ptolemy II Eurgetes borrowed the official copy of the Athenian dramatists, which became a decisive factor in imposing a standard of the text. Earlier commentaries, such as those of Aristarchus, are suggested to be made before the arrival of the Athenian official texts to Alexandria.

The Aristotelian tradition in Alexandria is reflected in a papyrus form Oxyrhynchus, which contains a commentary on Alcman. The writer of P.Oxy. 2438, about the life of Pindar, could interfere in the date concerning this poet depending on the didascaliae. Since Eratosthenes based

**
(42) Pach, 1388; 1409.
(43) Pach, 1395.
(45) Pach, 81, Frag 9; D.L. Page, Poetae Melici gr., Frs. 14, 16.
(46) The didascaliae are lists of victors in the dramatic competitions in Athens.
his informations on the lists of victors of the Olympiads, it is said that the writer of the Oxyrhynchus papyrus about Pindar depended on the original work by Eratosthenes.

The rhetor, who sat in his private school at Oxyrhynchus to teach his students the art of rhetoric by asking about subjects they could not answer without reading Euripides and Thucydides, was not only client of the Mouseion of Alexandria, but was also one of the media for diffusion of the Alexandrian scholarship in the chora. The livres d'Ecoliers, which were discovered in various parts, show the Alexandrian scholarship's impact when they introduce the epigrammata and the hymns arranged alphabetically. The paidagogia adopted the alphabetic order and the caiher Bouriant is a good example. In these caihars d'Ecoliers, there was gradual manuels used in Greek schools; and it is represented her by two fragments from Euripides, where the method depends on the Alexandrian scholarship, which we see also in the spread of the works of the great names like Callimachus, Theocritus, Apollonius Rhodius and others in the chora; and in the influence of the Alexandrian scholarship

(48) P.Oxy. 2400; E.G. Turner, op.cit., P. 85.
(49) O.Guerand et P. Jouguet, un livre d'Ecolier, P. XVII.
especially in the list of rivers which reminds us of the laterculi Alexandrini, as seen in the "Un Livre d'Ecolier". We may notice that the epigrammata of Callimachus, which were full of rare words that need explanation, are well represented in the teaching of the schools in the chora. They represent a genre which was tasted by the Greeks and answer the spirit of Alexandrianism. Moreover, the use of the anthologies, which show scholarly touch, were a principal element in the schools of the chora and attest the influence of the scholars of the Mouseion.

The theatre is not excluded in regard of evidence for the influence of the Alexandrian scholarship in the chora. It is interesting to know that the play of Euripides, Creso-phantes, was acted on the theatre of Oxyrhynchus, since extracts from this play were preserved in an acting copy on papyrus. We expect that various plays were acted on the theatre of Memphis and that of Panopolis, which were seated between eight and twelve thausands. An explanation had been previously introduced in regard of the variants and divergences in literary papyri from the standard texts. Another

---

50- O. Gueraud et P. Jouguet, un livre d'Ecolier, P. XXI.
51- Ibid., P. XXIII.
52- Ibid., P. XXIV.
54- P. Fouad XIV; P. Beaty panop. I. 333n.
interpretation may be added here. The actors are said to have added luminous occasion to emphasize a situation or to give themselves extended opportunity from dramatic effects. One may suggest here that theatre in Egypt in the Graeco-Roman period might have echoed the nature of the period. On one hand, we must have in mind the variants resulted from the scholarly nature in the Mouseion, when we compare the hymns of Callimachus with the Homeric Hymns. We can surely see that Callimachus’ Hymn to Zeus is greatly different from that of Homer. So, if the actors of the Greco-Roman theatre in Egypt made divergences, we then have to look for such variants in the work of the Alexandrians. On the other hand, Greeks in Egypt were minority, but intermarriage between Greeks and Egyptians, privileges in respect of taxes and absorption of the energies of Hellenism by the Egyptians must have played a role in regard of the Greek language and literature. Alexandria was the principal centre of learning the Greek culture and remained a pilgrimage to any one, even to be who μαθάνου γραμματα, since such persons are heared asking their friends in Alexandria to send them paper and books.

We surely feel the Alexandrian scholarship’s influence and the diffusion of the efforts of the scholars of the Mouseion in the chora in the list of comics and their plays.

(55) E.G. Turner, Greek Papyri, P. 107 ff.
arranged according to an alphabetical order on papyrus (57) found at Oxyrhynchus. The lines of the papyrus represent only the beginnings of the lines and we can not say if they had been complete, represented or not a kind of Pinakes of Callimachus.

To conclude this study we find it preferable to have a simple survey from which we may well understand how far the influence of Alexandria was in the chora. In the third century B.C., great scholars such as Asklepiades, Hedylos, callinashus, Eratosthens, Apollonius Rhodius, neither were born in Alexandria nor lived permanently in it, but their influence reached everywhere in Egypt. These authors still resemble the classical standard, though clearly different in various points from their ancestors. When we reach the first century B.C., we feel that the authors were influenced by the environment around them and became too far from the spirit of classical Greek literature. So is Leonidas of Alexandria, the author of epigrammata and works to be considered foreign in regard of real poetry. A Giessen papyrus preserved a small lyric poetry composed on the occasion of

the accession of Hadrian, and Pancrates wrote a panegyric, 
preserved on papyrus, in honour of Hadrian and his favour-
rite Antinoos, of a very modest level. So also the poem by 
Dionysius the Periegetes, and the hymn on a papyrus from 
Oxyrhynchus represent a faint echo of the classical lyric. 
In the third century A.D. another papyrus from Oxyrhynchus 
contain a hymn to Hermes, addressed to an archon. The works 
of literature continue to be weak representation of the 
classical Greek literature as seen in the epigrammata of 
Palladas the Alexandrian, about A.D. 400. When we come to 
the fifth century A.D., authors who lived in the metropolies 
enable us to hear again vigorous voice. This was, e.g. 
Nonnos of Panopolis who left us forty eight books named 
"Dionysiads", which are extremely remarkable. Nonnos realized 
a school, of which were Tryphiodorus, Collouthos, Christo-
dorus of Coptos, who followed Nonnos' steps and tried to 
imitate him. But from the study of the papyri of this period, 
we can say that there was no hope of the return of the 
classical standard. One may explain this phenomenon by 
(58) 
the Egyptian absorption and exhaustion of Hellenism. 

Cairo March 1986 

A.H. EL-MOSALLAMY 

58- See B.A. van Groningen, Le Egypte dans le Mouvement 
poetique Grec, Actes du Xe congr. Intern. de Pap., Warsaw 
1964, P. 27 ff.